

## INDEX

Sr. No.	Description	Page No.
<b>VOLUME-I</b>		<b>1-462</b>
<b>Part – I – Introductory</b>		<b>1-30</b>
<b>A</b>	Appointment of Enquiry Officer	1
<b>B</b>	Explanatory Note	1-2
<b>C</b>	Procedure of Enquiry	2
<b>D</b>	Nature and Scope of Enquiry	3-15
<b>E</b>	Relevant Provisions of the University	15-20
<b>F</b>	Statutes of the University	20-30
<b>Part – II –Collection of data – factual matrix</b>		<b>31-462</b>
<b>A</b>	Affidavits filed in this Enquiry	31
<b>B</b>	Decision-making process in the University	32-33
<b>C</b>	Selection process and selection	33-277
	<b>i</b> Constitution of the Selection Committee	34-40
	<b>ii</b> Advertisement with amendment dated 06.09.2004 respectively (Ex.2).	40-65
	<b>iii</b> Receipt of the applications of the candidates pursuant to the advertisement dated 14.8.2004 (Ex. 2) read with its addendum dated 6.9.2004 and their categorywise distribution :	66-67
	<b>iv</b> Determination of criteria for shortlisting of candidates.	68-78
	<b>v</b> Decision to hold combined / common interviews for both the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.), preparation of combined alphabetical lists of the candidates to be called for interviews for the said posts, and programme of interviews for them	79-82
	<b>vi</b> Issue of notice of meeting of the Selection Committee for taking interviews of the Candidates	82
	<b>vii</b> Determination of criteria for academic evaluation of SRA/JRA	82-100
	<b>viii</b> Assignment of the work of awarding marks as per the criteria	100-103
	<b>ix</b> Meeting of the Selection Committee	103-164
	<b>x</b> Preparation of the Mark-sheet of all the Candidates	164-175
	<b>xi</b> Procedure followed in preparation of the Selection Lists	175-190
	<b>xii</b> Selecting in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) favoured candidates as understood in this Enquiry Report	191-233
	<b>xiii</b> Non-Selection of YCMOU Graduates	233-237
	<b>xiv</b> Preparation of waiting lists	238-239
	<b>xv</b> Signing the Marksheet Ex.34(O)-A and the Selection Lists	239-250

	<b>xvi</b>	Discrepancies, Mistakes and Overwriting / applying white ink in the categorywise Mark-sheet Ex.34(O)-A, consolidated Mark-sheet, Ex. 112(O) and the Chart Ex. 38(O) about marks awarded by the Assistant Professors/ Associate Professor	251-260
	<b>xvii</b>	Preparing the proceedings of the meeting of the Selection Committee held from 13.6.2005 to 17.6.2005 and 20.6.2005 to 25.6.2005	260-269
	<b>xviii</b>	Handing over of the Selection Lists to the then Vice-Chancellor	269-277
<b>D</b>		Appointment of selected candidates in the posts of SRA (Agri.) And JRA (Agri.)	278-316
	<b>i</b>	Appointment of Acting Vice-Chancellor	278-279
	<b>ii</b>	Note-sheets of the Registrar's office showing vacancy position for making appointments in the posts of SRA (Agri.)/JRA (Agri.)	279-286
	<b>iii</b>	Procedure followed in making appointment	286-291
	<b>iv</b>	Appointment orders issued as per which Selection lists	291-304
	<b>v</b>	Vacancy position at the time of advertisement, interview, and appointment of the Selected Candidates	304-316
<b>E</b>		University set-up of the posts of SRA/JRA	317-382
	<b>i</b>	Sanctioned posts of SRA/JRA as per the revised Akrutibandh	317-319
	<b>ii</b>	Distribution of the posts of SRA/JRA in various Depts. / Offices/ Schemes etc. in the University	319-321
	<b>iii</b>	Establishment of Independent Centres / Units and deployment therein of surplus posts of SRA from Research Schemes/Stations/ Departments.	321-323
	<b>iv</b>	Transfer of SRAs to the newly allotted posts of SRAs in Independent Centres/Units and duties and responsibilities in such posts	323-330
	<b>v</b>	Comparative charts of Departmentwise Staff Position of the sanctioned posts of SRA/JRA as per the University circular dated 27.2.1997, the revised Akrutibandh, and the actual Departmentwise Staff position of the said posts.	330-332
	<b>vi</b>	Nomenclature of various posts of SRA/JRA	332-340
	<b>vii</b>	Whether there are any sanctioned posts of JRA (Agri.Engg.)	340-344
	<b>viii</b>	Whether the Department of Agricultural Engineering is under the control of the Dean, Faculty of Agriculture or the Dean, Faculty of Agricultural Engineering and what about the posts of SRA/JRA therein	344-348

	<b>ix</b>	Sanctioned posts of SRA (Agri.Engg.)	348-368
	<b>x</b>	Sanctioned posts of SRA in Bio-Technology/ Bio-chemistry	368-373
	<b>xi</b>	Sanctioned posts of SRA (Computer) and JRA (Computer)	373
	<b>xii</b>	Sanctioned posts of Senior Technical Assistant in independent Estate Unit under the control of the University Engineer.	373-379
	<b>xiii</b>	Sanctioned posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	379-382
<b>F</b>		Reservation policy of the university	383-404
	<b>i</b>	Statutory provisions	383-384
	<b>ii</b>	Whether the Selection of SRA/JRA is vitiated for not associating the officer from the Social Welfare Department in the Selection Committee	384-386
	<b>iii</b>	G.Rs. prescribing 100 point Roaster and giving guidelines to implement it	386-387
	<b>iv</b>	Note of B.C.Cell showing how to implement the reservation policy of the Government by following 100 point Roster	388-391
	<b>v</b>	Procedure of making vertical as well as Horizontal Reservation in Direct Recruitment	391-395
	<b>vi</b>	Factual Data about how the Reservation policy was followed by the University in making these appointments of SRA (Agri.)/JRA (Agri.) pursuant to the advertisement dated 14.8.2004 (Ex.2)	395-399
	<b>vii</b>	University never followed the Reservation policy of the State Government in making selection and appointment by nomination and promotion in this post.	399-404
<b>G</b>		Objections to selection and selection process	405-446
<b>H</b>		Justification of selection process and selection	447-462
<b>VOLUME-II</b>			<b>463-903</b>
<b>Part - III - Appreciation / assessment of materials on record</b>			<b>463-903</b>
<b>A</b>		Applicability of article 14 and 16 of the Constitution of India	463
<b>B</b>		Decision making process in the university	464
<b>C</b>		Selection process and selection	465-713
	<b>i</b>	Constitution of the Selection Committee	465-468
	<b>ii</b>	Advertisement dated 14.8.2004 with its addendum dated 6.9.2004 collectively marked as (Ex.2)	468-491
	<b>iii</b>	Criteria laid down for Short-listing of candidates due to receipt of large number of applications for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) in question	491-519

	<b>iv</b>	Common interviews held for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	519-534
	<b>v</b>	Determination of criteria for academic evaluation of SRA/JRA	535-583
	<b>vi</b>	Award of marks for Academic Performance	584-599
	<b>vii</b>	Award of marks for performance in interview	599-637
	<b>viii</b>	Preparation of the Mark-sheets of all the candidates	637-656
	<b>ix</b>	Preparation of the Selection Lists	656-673
	<b>x</b>	Non-Selection of YCMOU graduates	673-675
	<b>xi</b>	Waiting Lists not prepared for reasons better known to Dr.V.D.Patil, the Chairman, and Dr.Vandan Mohod, the Registrar/ Member Secretary of the Selection Committee	675-677
	<b>xii</b>	Signing the Categorywise Mark-Sheet Ex. 34(O)-A separate for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) and Selection Lists of the said posts by the Chairman and the Members of the Selection Committee.	678-687
	<b>xii-A</b>	Selection of candidates for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) not finalized and the Selection Lists not prepared by nor approved in the meeting of the Selection Committee.	687-691
	<b>xii-B</b>	Entire selection process and selection of candidates pursuant thereto in these posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) is vitiated by bias of Dr. V. D. Patil, the Chairman of the Selection Committee	691-692
	<b>xiii</b>	Preparation of the proceedings / minutes of the meeting of the Selection Committee held from 13.6.2005 to 17.6.2005 and 20.6.2005 to 25.6.2005.	692-705
	<b>xiv</b>	Handing over the Selection Lists to the then Vice-Chancellor.	705-713
<b>D</b>		Appointment of the selected candidates in the posts of SRA (Agri.) And JRA (Agri.)	714-803
	<b>i</b>	Appointment of Dr.V.D. Patil, Dean/ D.I./Chairman of the Selection Committee as Acting Vice-Chancellor	714-716
	<b>ii</b>	Note-sheet of the Registrar's office showing vacancy position for making appointment of the Selected Candidates in the posts of SRA(Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) contained in the file Ex. 42(O).	716-719
	<b>iii</b>	Utilization of posts in promotion quota for making appointment by nomination is illegal and improper	719-722
	<b>iv</b>	Procedure followed in making appointment	723-727
	<b>v</b>	Total number of posts of SRA/JRA as shown in the Movement Register (Ex. 644(O))	727-734
	<b>vi</b>	Charts filed by the University showing vacancy position in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) at the time of the advertisement i.e. as on 31.7.2004, at the time of interview i.e. as on 12.06.2005, and at the time of appointment i.e. as on 15.09.2005	735-739

	<b>vii</b>	Verification of the charts about vacancy position filed by the University referred to in the previous topic to see whether due to selection of some SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) in the posts of Assistant Professors, 55 vacant posts of SRA (Agri.) and 76 posts of JRA (Agri.) were available	740-774
	<b>viii</b>	Need to make Enquiry to find out whether the posts in other than the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) were utilized for making appointment of all the candidates selected in the said posts	774-777
	<b>ix</b>	Whether the posts other than the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) were utilized for making appointments of the candidates selected in the said posts if so, how many.	777-803
<b>E</b>		Reservation policy of the government not followed by the university	804-816
	<b>i</b>	Whether the Selection of the candidates in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) is vitiated for not associating in the Selection Committee officer from the Social welfare department of the State Government.	805-805
	<b>ii</b>	100 point Roster for direct recruitment admittedly not followed to implement the Reservation policy of the State Govt.	805-806
	<b>iii</b>	Reservation of posts for backward classes (Social/Vertical Reservation) not made according to their prescribed percentages as per the relevant G.Rs. as claimed by the Chairman and the Member Secretary of the Selection Committee	806-811
	<b>iv</b>	Horizontal reservation not made : no candidate of the categories in Horizontal Reservation selected	812-816
<b>F</b>		Illegalities, flaws, consequential reshuffling of selection lists and other infirmities in preparation of selection lists of these posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	817-845
	<b>i</b>	Selection Lists not prepared according to the procedure and the guidelines laid down in the G.R. dated 16.3.1999 (Ex. 703) (Annexure-34 of the Enquiry Report).	817-821
	<b>ii</b>	Selection Lists of Open category candidates not prepared first in descending order of merit irrespective of the reserved category to which the candidate belongs as required by para 5 of the G.R. dated 16.3.1999 (Ex.703) (Annexure-34 of the Enquiry Report)	821-830
	<b>iii</b>	Procedure adopted by the Chairman and the Member Secretary of the Selection Committee for preparation of the Selection Lists not followed by them	830-837
	<b>iv</b>	Candidates who do not find place in any Selection List	837-839

	<b>v</b>	Additional infirmities in the existing Selection Lists	839-845
<b>G</b>		Selecting in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) favoured candidates as understood in this Enquiry Report.	846-903
	<b>i</b>	Short Listing of candidates for the purpose of making selection of proper candidates in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	846-850
	<b>ii</b>	Criteria for academic evaluation of SRA /JRA laid down on 31.5.2005	850-851
	<b>iii</b>	The candidates who were illegally benefited by the marks awarded to them for Ph.D. degree acquired, Ph.D. thesis submitted, research paper / popular articles published, and/or Significant Contribution made after the last date of application i.e. 15.9.2004	851-853
	<b>iv</b>	Manipulation of marks for interview by making changes even by erasing marks of some candidates originally shown against their names in the consolidated alphabetical Mark-Sheet Ex.112(O) and also categorywise Mark-Sheet Ex.34(O)-A, separate for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.).	853
	<b>v</b>	List of favoured candidates ready	854-855
	<b>vi</b>	Changes made in the consolidated alphabetical Mark-Sheet Ex.112(O) and the categorywise Mark-Sheet Ex.34(O)-A separate for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) by overwriting in the Marks awarded to some candidates for their interviews and consequently changing also the total marks awarded to them	855-856
	<b>vii</b>	Canvassing in any form prohibited	856-858
	<b>viii</b>	Glaring instances of favoured candidates	858-903
<b>VOLUME-III</b>			<b>904-1187</b>
<b>Part – IV - Findings and conclusions</b>			<b>904-1187</b>
<b>A</b>		Applicability of Article 14 and 16 of the Constitution of India	904
<b>B</b>		Decision making process in the University	904-905
<b>C</b>		Selection process and selection	905-1037
	<b>i</b>	Constitution of the Selection Committee	905
	<b>ii</b>	Advertisement dated 14.8.2004 with its addendum dated 06.09.2004 collectively marked as Ex. 2	905-908
	<b>iii</b>	Criteria laid down for short-listing of candidates for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	908-921
	<b>iv</b>	Common interviews held for both the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	921-929
	<b>v</b>	Criteria for academic evaluation of SRA/JRA laid down on 31.5.2005	929-951
	<b>vi</b>	Award of marks for academic performance	951-957
	<b>vii</b>	Award of marks for performance in interview	957-980
	<b>viii</b>	Preparation of the Mark-sheets of all the candidates	980-992
	<b>ix</b>	Preparation of the Selection Lists	993-1004

	<b>x</b>	Non-Selection of YCMOU graduates	1004-1006
	<b>xi</b>	Waiting List not given in preparation of the Selection Lists for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	1006-1008
	<b>xii</b>	Signing the Categorywise Mark-sheet Ex.34(O)-A separate for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) and Selection Lists of the said posts	1008-1016
	<b>xii-A</b>	Selection of candidates for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) not finalized by the Selection Committee and it did not discharge any of its duties and responsibilities except taking common interviews of the candidates for these posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	1016-1018
	<b>xii-B</b>	Entire selection process and selection of candidates pursuant thereto in these posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) is vitiated by bias of Dr. V. D. Patil, the Chairman of the Selection Committee	1018
	<b>xiii</b>	Preparation of the proceedings/minutes of the meeting of the Selection Committee held from 13.6.2005 to 17.6.2005 and 20.6.2005 to 25.6.2005	1019-1028
	<b>xiv</b>	Handing over the Selection Lists to the then Vice-Chancellor	1028-1037
<b>D</b>		Appointment of the selected candidates in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	1038-
	<b>i</b>	Appointment of Dr.V.D. Patil, Dean/ D.I./Chairman of the Selection Committee as Acting Vice-Chancellor	1038-1040
	<b>ii</b>	Note-sheet of the Registrar's office showing vacancy position for making appointment of the Selected Candidates in the posts of SRA(Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) contained in the file Ex. 42(O).	1041-1045
	<b>iii</b>	Utilization of the posts in promotion quota for making appointment by nomination is illegal and improper	1045-1048
	<b>iv</b>	Procedure followed in making appointment	1048-1051
	<b>v</b>	Total number of posts of SRA/JRA as shown in the Movement Register (Ex. 644(O))	1051-1058
	<b>vi</b>	Charts filed by the University showing vacancy position in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) at the time of the advertisement i.e. as on 31.7.2004, at the time of interview i.e. as on 12.06.2005, and at the time of appointment i.e. as on 15.09.2005	1058-1062
	<b>vii</b>	Verification of the charts about vacancy position filed by the University referred to in the previous topic to see whether due to selection of some SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) in the posts of Assistant Professors, 55 vacant posts of SRA (Agri.) and 76 posts of JRA (Agri.) were available	1062-1087

	<b>viii</b>	Whether the posts other than the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) were utilized for making appointments of the candidates selected in the said posts if so, how many.	1088-1107
<b>E</b>		Reservation policy of the government not followed by the university	1108-1121
	<b>i</b>	Whether the Selection of the candidates in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) is vitiated for not associating in the Selection Committee officer from the Social welfare department of the State Government.	1108-1109
	<b>ii</b>	100 point roster for direct recruitment admittedly not followed to implement the reservation policy of the State Government.	1109-1110
	<b>iii</b>	Reservation of the posts for backward classes (Social/Vertical reservation) not made according to their prescribed percentages as per the relevant G.Rs. as claimed by the Chairman and the Member Secretary of the Selection Committee	1110-1115
	<b>iv</b>	Horizontal reservation not made : No candidate is selected in any category in horizontal reservation	1116-1121
<b>F</b>		Illegalities, flaws, consequential re-shuffling of selection lists and other infirmities in preparation of the selection lists of these posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	1122-1139
	<b>i</b>	Selection Lists of these posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) should have been prepared according to the procedure and the guidelines laid down in the G.R. dated 16.3.1999 (Ex.703) (Annexure No.34 of the Enquiry Report)	1122-1124
	<b>ii</b>	Selection Lists of open category candidates not prepared first in descending order of merit irrespective of the reserved category not deleted as per para 5 of the G.R. dated 16.3.1999 (Ex.703) (Annexure-34 of the Enquiry Report)	1124-1130
	<b>iii</b>	Procedure adopted by the Chairman and the Member Secretary of the Selection Committee for preparation of the Selection Lists not followed by them	1130-1134
	<b>iv</b>	The names and particulars of the candidates in the reserved categories who also applied in open category but could not be selected in the said open category in the post in which they were selected in their reserved category.	1135
	<b>v</b>	Additional infirmities in the existing Selection Lists	1135-1139
<b>G</b>		Selecting in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) favoured candidates as understood in this Enquiry Report	1140-
	<b>i</b>	Short-listing of candidates for the purpose of making selection of proper candidates in the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	1140-1143



	<b>ii</b>	Criteria for academic evaluation of SRA/JRA laid down on 31.5.2005	1143-1144
	<b>iii</b>	Candidates who were illegally benefitted by the marks awarded to them for Ph.D. degree acquired, Ph.D. thesis submitted, research papers/popular articles published and / or significant contribution made after the last date of application i.e. 15.9.2004	1145-1146
	<b>iv</b>	Manipulation of marks for interview by making changes even by erasing marks of some candidates originally shown against their names in the consolidated alphabetical Mark-sheet Ex.112(O) and also the categorywise Mark-sheet Ex.34(O)-A separate for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.)	1147
	<b>v</b>	List of favoured candidates ready	1148-1149
	<b>vi</b>	Changes made in the consolidated alphabetical Mark-sheet Ex.112(O) and the categorywise Mark-sheet Ex.34(O)-A separate for the posts of SRA (Agri.) and JRA (Agri.) by overwriting in the marks awarded to some candidates for their interviews and consequently changing also the total marks awarded to them	1149-1150
	<b>vii</b>	Canvassing in any form prohibited	1150-1152
	<b>viii</b>	Glaring instances of favoured candidates	1152-1187
<b>Part –V – Summery of Conclusions and Recommendations</b>			<b>1188-1309</b>
<b>VOLUME – IV</b>			
<b>Annexures</b>			